Youth Apprenticeship in America Today

Wisconsin Youth Apprenticeship Forum

Brent Parton
Deputy Director
New America’s Center on Education and Skills
March 14, 2018
WHAT IS NEW AMERICA?

• **Nonpartisan think tank** headquartered Washington, DC

• **The Center on Education and Skills** focuses on strengthening linkages between learning and work, and schools and local economies.
  
  ➢ **Research, analyze and communicate** education and workforce policy trends, challenges
  
  ➢ **Engage with policymakers** to develop policy solutions
  
  ➢ **Elevate work of “doers” and support dissemination** of good practice and innovation
What do they have in common?

Governor Bill Clinton (D-AR)
Governor Tommy Thompson (R-WI)
Governor John Hickenlooper (D-CO)
What They See:

✓ **SCALE**: A clear national system and policy framework

✓ **INDUSTRY**: Industry organized and invested across sectors

✓ **YOUTH**: Apprenticeship as a mainstream education option
“Why Not Here?”

- There’s no incentives
- Who will do the Work?
- College is the American Dream
- They Have Real Socialists Over There
- American Employers Don’t Train
- They’ve been doing it for 15,000 years
- This isn’t Europe
- Reinforces Inequity
- Parents Won’t Want This
- Employers Won’t Hire Youth
Experimentation with Youth Apprenticeship

**SCHOOL-TO-WORK**
- Sustained federal support to states for broad career exposure activities

**“EURO INVASION”**
- Initiative of foreign firms focused in Carolinas
- Regional sector partnerships for Registered programs

**STATE LEADERSHIP**
- State-led focus on public-private partnerships
- Bolstered by new federal funds for apprenticeship
“While all agreed that the principles of youth apprenticeship represent authentic and powerful tools for effective learning, they differ sharply on critical matters of program design, location of learning, and, indeed, whether a wholly new system of learning is required or whether we are better advised to adapt existing structures and programs. In either case, building an effective youth-apprenticeship system does not only require new programs, but also major changes in the ways the education and employment systems relate to each other.”

- William T. Grant Foundation, Commission on Work Family and Citizenship (1992)
Some Lessons Learned

• Balancing rigor and flexibility in work-based learning. **Youth apprenticeship is the biggest ask, with the biggest possible upside.**

• Confronting tracking legacies and the equity imperative head on. **Equity is a design principle and an outcome.**

• **Youth apprenticeship is a post-secondary option. Not an alternative.** Design it that way.

• **Youth apprenticeship needs infrastructure. Not all of it has to be new.** Align and integrate with the broader CTE and apprenticeship policy ecosystem.
Key Findings

1. Alignment with Education and Workforce Trends

1. Public Openness to Youth Apprenticeship

2. A Diverse National Landscape

3. State Strategies for Scale
“American education has become so preoccupied with those that go on to college that they have lost sight of those that do not. And more and more the non-college bound now fall between the cracks when they are in-school, when they drop out, or graduate inadequately prepared for society or the workplace. There is a sharp disparity between what Americans do for college bound youth, and the what they do for the forgotten half.”
Source: Georgetown University Center on Education and the Workforce, America’s Divided Recovery: College Haves and Have-Nots (2016)
A New Forgotten Half?

College Completion: Six Year Outcomes (2010 Cohort)

- Not Enrolled
- Still Enrolled
- Completed at Different Institution
- Completed at Starting Institution

Overall: 43.4% 51.0% 9.3% 47.5%
Asian: 13.2% 16.8% 17.4% 14.5%
Black: 12.8% 12.2% 9.3% 28.7%
Hispanic: 12.8% 16.8% 17.4% 35.6%
White: 30.5% 20.0% 44.6% 26.9%

National Student Clearinghouse Research Center. Completing College: A National View of Student Attainment Rates by Race and Ethnicity (2016)
In Line with “Career Readiness”

- Increase Attainment of Credentials
- Increase Participation in Work-Based Learning
- Increase Applied Learning

Which ones are valuable?
What’s a quality experience?
What’s relevant to the real world?
In Line with “Career Readiness”

- Increase Attainment of Credentials
- Increase Participation in Work-Based Learning
- Increase Applied Learning

“ENGAGE” INDUSTRY

Which ones are valuable?
What’s a quality experience?
What’s relevant to the real world?
A Career Ready Option

Partner and Invest with Industry

Build Post-Secondary Option

Culminates in Portable Credential
Delivered through High Quality Work-Based Learning
Supplemented by Related Applied Learning
RISKS FOR EMPLOYERS

• Longer Time to Hire
• New Hire Premiums
• Retention Risks
• On-boarding Costs

From: Dismissed by Degrees: How Degree Inflation is Undermining U.S. Competitiveness and Hurting America’s Middle Class
Regional Variation Job Postings Requiring B.A.

“Up-credentialing makes jobs harder to fill, particularly as the workforce ages.”
- Professor Joe Fuller, Harvard Business School
Demography Is Destiny

The Aging of the American Workforce

- Percentage of workers over age 65

Source: Census Bureau, Moody's Analytics
The changing face of America, 1965-2065

% of the total population

- White: 46%
- Black: 13%
- Hispanic: 24%
- Asian: 14%
- All other: 3%
Youth in the Apprenticeship Momentum

“Help States advance Registered Apprenticeship as a workforce development strategy and postsecondary education career pathway...innovative approaches to connect secondary and post-secondary education pathways to apprenticeship, remains an underutilized tool for increasing youth employment rates.”

- APPRENTICESHIP USA EXPANSION GRANT FOA

“...focusing in particular on expanding access to and participation in apprenticeships among students at accredited secondary and post secondary educational institutions...promote apprenticeships and pre apprenticeships for America's high school students”

- 2017 EXECUTIVE ORDER ON EXPANDING APPRENTICESHIP
## Public Support for Apprenticeship

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Somewhat favorable</th>
<th>Very favorable</th>
<th>Somewhat unfavorable</th>
<th>Very unfavorable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public 4-yr colleges</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Apprenticeship programs</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community colleges</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Private colleges</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>For-Profit colleges</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Do you favor or oppose increasing government funding for apprenticeship education programs that combine paid on-the-job learning with classroom instruction so that participants learn both academic and job relevant knowledge and skills?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Strongly Favor</th>
<th>Total Favor</th>
<th>Total Oppose</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Men</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Under 50</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Over 50</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College men</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College women</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-college men</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-college women</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>96</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latino</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Democrat</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Republican</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childless man</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Childless woman</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heard a lot/some</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heard not much/nothing</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>81</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Youth Apprenticeship Focus Groups

“Since I became a senior everyone is like, “Where are you going to college?” It’s the first question they ask, automatically. And if my answer or anyone’s answer for that matter doesn’t match the preconceived vision of what they think our futures should look like, they are taken aback—like that is the only way to continue.”

- Allison, Denver High School Student
“Nowadays they just kind of push us through high school and they are, “All right, when you get to college you will learn this.” But half the people drop out of college and they don’t have the skills. So if we could go into the world with real skills, we could make money. And then it is debt free… my mom is always like, oh yeah, I have been out of college for 20 years and I am still paying debts.”

- Joshua, Charlotte Student
Youth Apprenticeship Focus Groups

MODERATOR: “Write Down First thing that comes to mind when you hear the word “Apprentice.””

“I put Trump.”

MODERATOR: “Who else had Donald Trump?”

(5 out of 10 Denver Students show same name written down).
2017 Youth Apprenticeship Focus Groups

Benefits:
- “There’s nothing I don’t like”
- “Free college”
- “No debt”
- “Boosting, long-term lifetime earnings”

Concerns:
- “Credits may not transfer to another school”
- “Narrow occupational fields”
- “Miss the experience?”

→ American Youth Apprenticeship will need to balance being a distinct, attractive post-secondary option, without looking like an alternative.
What is a Youth Apprenticeship?

- Related Classroom-Based Instruction
- Paid On-the-Job Learning and Mentorship
- Assessment of Skills Against Standards
- Industry Recognized Credential

✓ Required Element
✓ Role of Industry
Youth Apprenticeship is a Partnership

- **Employers** working with education partners to identify skills requirements, build training plans, and deliver paid on-the-job training.

- **High schools** enabling student participation, on-the-job learning, and postsecondary related instruction, while helping students meet graduation requirements.

- **Postsecondary institutions** delivering related instruction and assessing learning that leads to postsecondary credit and credential attainment.

- **An intermediary** coordinates the activity of key partners to support employers and the success of apprentices.
Youth Apprenticeship Partnership Activity
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State Youth Apprenticeship Programs</th>
<th>Registered Youth Apprenticeship Programs</th>
<th>State Youth Apprenticeship Partnerships</th>
<th>CTE Pre-Apprenticeship Pathways</th>
<th>State Youth Apprenticeship Pilots</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Georgia, Wisconsin</td>
<td>North Carolina</td>
<td>Colorado, South Carolina</td>
<td>California, Kentucky, Ohio, Oregon</td>
<td>Illinois, Maryland, Michigan, Washington</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scale</td>
<td>Thousands</td>
<td>Hundreds</td>
<td>Hundreds</td>
<td>Under 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance</td>
<td>State policy/program requirements</td>
<td>Registered or program guidelines</td>
<td>State policy/program requirement, Aligned to RA</td>
<td>Registered and/or program guidelines</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State investment</td>
<td>Grants to regions</td>
<td>Tuition reimbursement</td>
<td>State intermediary</td>
<td>Program coordinators</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portable Credential</td>
<td>State Youth Apprenticeship Credential</td>
<td>RA Certificate</td>
<td>RA Certificate or industry credential/college credit</td>
<td>Advanced standing in RA, may require industry credential</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry Focus</td>
<td>Multiple</td>
<td>Advanced manufacturing</td>
<td>Multiple</td>
<td>Construction and Trades, Manufacturing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post- Sec Instruction</td>
<td>Technical college or employer</td>
<td>Community college</td>
<td>Varies</td>
<td>CTE Skills Center or Technical College</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Profiling Three State Strategies to Scale Youth Apprenticeship Partnerships

- Wisconsin: Investing in Statewide Infrastructure
- North Carolina: Franchising Regional Consortia
- Colorado: Building a Statewide Public-Private Partnership
Diverse State Strategies Share

✓ A clear framework to guide quality, consistency and scale
✓ Industry-wide approaches to pathway, curricula and program development
✓ Policy to enable learning, and real credit for it across settings
✓ Sustainable financing for related, postsecondary instruction
✓ Sustainable financing model for intermediary capacity

A clear policy framework sets goals, quality baseline, roles and responsibilities
Diverse State Strategies Share

✓ A clear framework to guide quality, consistency and scale
✓ Industry-wide approaches to pathway, curricula and program development
✓ Policy to enable learning, and real credit for it across settings
✓ Sustainable financing for related, postsecondary instruction
✓ Sustainable financing model for intermediary capacity

Policy and systems change to enable and recognize genuine learning in the workplace
Diverse State Strategies Share

✓ A clear framework to guide quality, consistency and scale
✓ Industry-wide approaches to pathway, curricula and program development
✓ Policy to enable learning, and real credit for it across settings
✓ Sustainable financing for related, postsecondary instruction
✓ Sustainable financing model for intermediary capacity

Tax credits are nice. These may be the most powerful incentives for employers.
**Diverse State Strategies Share**

✓ A clear framework to guide quality, consistency and scale
✓ Industry-wide approaches to pathway, curricula and program development
✓ Policy to enable learning, and real credit for it across settings
✓ Sustainable financing for related, postsecondary instruction
✓ Sustainable financing model for intermediary capacity

This is the biggest design lift. In some industries they exist to coordinate and finance the apprenticeship experiences. In most industries new to apprenticeship, they don’t. Schools, not just employers, also need to capacity to coordinate.
Where Does Wisconsin Lead?

- Sustained Public and Private investment
- Broad Industry Participation
- State Career Pathway Framework
- Data Collection
What’s Changed Since the 1990s?

• Postsecondary is the new minimum
• Expansion and Modernization of Registered Apprenticeship
• ESSA and Career Readiness
• Technology, Data and Assessment
• Employers experimenting, incentives to invest
Projected wages and productivity, relative to standard FTE\textsuperscript{1}

- Wage and value of apprentice's contribution to production
- Worker productivity
- Apprentice wage
- MP (marginal product of labor)
- Employer benefits during apprenticeship
- Experienced worker's wage
- Employer benefits after apprenticeship
- MP = marginal product of labor

Period of apprenticeship

Experienced worker

Wisconsin’s Next Steps?

• To expand…
  – Industry Leadership on Pathway Development and Investment
  – Support for Consortia Start-up

• To strengthen…
  – More Systemic Connection to Education
  – Data Collection, Analysis and Research

• What Else?
Next Steps for Us

• Launch of National Youth Apprenticeship Learning Network

• Project on Putting Equity at the Center of Youth Apprenticeship

• A National Partnership to Advance Youth Apprenticeship?
The American economy is demanding more education just to grab the first rung of the middle class. Established industry sectors are raising skills thresholds for good paying jobs, and new industries emerge with new skills needs they are struggling to meet. At the same time, the education needed to develop these skills is a scarce, and expensive resource. While the benefit to more education is clear, less than half of people finish their education with a meaningful credential in hand. The country’s future lies with the success of the most diverse generation of youth. Many in the public chafe at the idea of spending more public dollars to expand “elitist” education institutions.

The Year? 1918.

Thank You

Reach Out:
parton@newamerica.org

Find the Report: